New Evidence Characterizing Temperature-dependent Sex Determination in Broad-snouted Caiman, Caiman latirostris

María Virginia Parachú Marcó1,2,4, Pamela Leiva1,3, Josefina Luciana Jungman1,4,5, Melina Soledad Simoncini1,3, and Carlos Ignacio Piña1,3,6

1Proyecto Yacaré - Laboratorio de Zoología Aplicada: Anexo Vertebrados - Facultad de Humanidades y Ciencias - Universidad Nacional del Litoral / Ministerio de Aguas, Servicios Públicos y Medio Ambiente, Av. Aristóbulo del Valle 8700, CP 3000, Santa Fe, Argentina
2Laboratorio de Biología Celular y Molecular Aplicada (LBCMA), Instituto de Ciencias Veterinarias del Litoral (ICiVet - Litoral), Universidad Nacional del Litoral (UNL) / Consejo Nacional de Investigaciones Científicas y Tecnológicas (CONICET), R.P. Kreder 2805, CP 3080, Esperanza, Santa Fe, Argentina
3Centro de Investigaciones Científicas y Transferencia de Tecnología a la Producción -UAdER-Prov Entre Ríos - Consejo Nacional de Investigaciones Científicas y Técnicas, FCyT, Dr. Matteri y España s/n, CP 3105 Diamante, Entre Ríos, Argentina
4Facultad de Humanidades y Ciencias, Universidad Nacional del Litoral, Paraje El Pozo s/n, CP 3000, Santa Fe, Argentina
5Facultad de Bioquímica y Ciencias Biológicas, Universidad Nacional del Litoral, Paraje El Pozo s/n, CP 3000, Santa Fe, Argentina
6Corresponding author, e-mail: cidcarlos@infoaire.com.ar

Abstract.—Temperature-dependent sex determination (TSD) occurs in all three families of the Crocodylia. This study explored the sex ratio of hatchlings under incubation temperatures not previously tested in Caiman latirostris to delineate the transitional range of temperature (TRT) between male- and female-producing temperatures. We also estimated the pivotal temperature (T_piv) of C. latirostris from our study site. We incubated eggs at various temperatures (31°, 32°, 33°, and 34° C). Incubation temperature had a significant effect on sex determination, but had no effect in hatching success. Eggs incubated at 31° C produced 100% females, 32° C produced approximately 70% females, and incubation at 33° C and 34° C produced only males. The TRT was > 31° to < 33° C for female to male transitions, and > 34° C and a temperature > 34.5° C male to female. Results indicate that the limits of T_piv should be between 32–33° C (lower T_piv), and between 34–34.5° C (upper T_piv) for the population of C. latirostris in Santa Fe, Argentina. Our analysis support the female-male-female (FMF) pattern, but higher temperature females may be rarely seen in wild because survival of females incubated at such high temperatures is very low.

Key Words.—Crocodylia; incubation; pivotal temperatures; sex determination; transition temperatures

Introduction

Sex can be determined genetically or environmentally. Temperature-dependent sex determination (TSD) is a type of environmental sex determination in which temperature experienced during embryonic development influence the sex of the offspring. It has been shown to occur in many fish (Conover 2004), most turtles (Ewert et al. 1994), and some lizards (Rhen and Crews 1999). In addition, researchers have demonstrated TSD in the 12 crocodilian species examined, which occur in all three designated families of the Order Crocodylia (Lang and Andrews 1994; Piña et al. 2003; Deeming 2004; Valenzuela 2004).

Within the family Alligatoridae, the American Alligator (Alligator mississippiensis) was the first species documented with TSD (Ferguson and Joanen 1982) in which certain incubation temperatures were shown to generate sexual phenotype ratios of 50%. Mrosovsky and Pieau (1991) defined these certain incubation temperatures as pivotal temperatures within TSD species (T_piv). Of note, the pivotal temperature for a particular TSD species resides within a transitional range of temperatures (TRT), or the range of constant incubation temperatures that produce both sexes in variable sex ratios. Broad-snouted Caiman (Caiman latirostris) as described by Ewert et al. (1994) exhibits Pattern II TSD (female-male-female) which includes low viable temperatures (29° C and 31° C) producing100% females, 33° C producing 100% males, and higher viable temperature (34.5° C) producing some females but with a very low hatching success (16%, Piña
et al. 2003, 2007; Lungman and Piña 2013). However, $T_{ps}$ and TRT have yet to be determined for this species and our aim was to characterize these defined thermal endpoints within a population of *C. latirostris* from Santa Fe Province, Argentina.

**Materials and Methods**

We collected Broad-snouted Caiman eggs from nine wild nests shortly after oviposition during two breeding seasons, and transported to the Proyecto Yacaré facilities in Santa Fe province, Argentina. We determined individual egg viability by the presence of an opaque eggshell banding and we included only those eggs considered viable (n = 172) in the experiment. We determined embryo stage (i.e., clutch age) by opening one representative egg from each clutch following Lungman et al. (2008). At the beginning of the experiment, all clutches had a structural age lower than stage 10 (equivalent to 10 d of incubation at 31° C), which is at least 10 d younger than the beginning of the reported temperature-sensitive period reported for the species (Piña et al. 2007). We evenly distributed eggs from each clutch among established temperature incubation treatment groups, with two replicates for each treatment group (total 10 incubators, four in the first breeding season and six in the second one). We incubated eggs in constant-temperature incubators (Model SEMEDIC I-290D, INGELAB, Buenos Aires, Argentina) following Piña et al. (2005) and we maintained the eggs at high humidity following Lungman et al. (2008; humidity records not maintained). We incubated eggs at either 32° C or 33° C (± 0.3° C) during the first breeding season with two replicates (total four digital incubators), and at 31° C, 33° C, or 34° C (± 0.3° C) during the second breeding season with two replicates (total six digital incubators). Digital recording verified that incubation temperatures remained within 1° C of their overall mean throughout the incubation period in both seasons. For example, 100% of recorded temperatures in the most stable incubator varied only ± 0.2° C (from 30.8° to 31.2° C), while 83% of temperatures in the least stable incubator varied -0.2° C to 0.3° C (from 30.8° to 31.3° C); both incubators produced 100% females. We monitored temperatures with HOBOTM Data Loggers (± 0.1° C; Onset Computer Corporation, Pocasset, Massachusetts, USA) placed throughout the plastic trays and checked daily throughout the incubation period.

After hatching, we maintained caiman (n = 141) under farming conditions (Piña and Larriera 2002). At four months of age, we determined sex in the majority of animals (n = 132) by histological methods (n = 100, 76%) and visual examination of the clitero-penis (n = 24, 18%; Nuñez Otaño et al. 2010). It was not possible to determine sex for the remaining nine individuals (6% of total).

We analyzed data using Info-Stat® (Di Rienzo et al. 2008). We expressed all values as mean ± standard deviation (SD) with statistical significance set at $P \leq 0.05$. We tested variables for normality with the Kolmogorov-Smirnov test, and homogeneity of variances between groups verified with the Levene test. Data were normal and homoscedastic. We compared proportions of females to males at each nest temperature using Chi-square. To compare hatching success among incubation temperatures, we used a one-way ANOVA with temperature treatment as the grouping factor and hatching success (# of hatchlings / # of eggs) of every nest as dependent variable. We reported the TRT bounded by two limits: the limit of maximum masculinization (100% individuals) and the limit of maximum feminization (Mrosovsky and Pieau 1991). We determined TRT from a prior study of TSD in *C. latirostris* (Piña et al. 2003), and with the sex ratios determined under the new incubation temperatures used in this study. To estimate $T_{ps}$ (Mrosovsky and Pieau1991), we plotted the percentage of females against incubation temperature and identified the two consecutive incubation temperatures that include the temperature that should produce a 50% sex ratio. We obtained supplementary data for the graph (eggs incubated at 29° C and 34.5° C) from Piña et al. (2003), a study made in the same caiman population.

**Results**

Incubation temperature affected sex determination in *C. latirostris*. We obtained 100% females at 31° C, 71.6% females at 32° C, and 0% females at 33° C and 34° C (Fig. 1). At 32° C the proportion of females varied significantly among nests (17–100% females, $X^2 = 11.98$, df = 4, $P = 0.017$). We determined lower TRT to be above 31° C and under 33° C, while the upper TRT has the lower limit above 34° C, and the higher limit at a temperature higher than 34.5° C, because we do not yet know the upper limit for maximum feminization and embryo viability. Lower $T_{ps}$ should be between 32° and 33° C (closer to 32° C), and higher $T_{ps}$ should be between 34° and 34.5° C (closer to 34.5° C; Fig. 1). We did not find a significant difference in hatching success among treatments ($F_{3,18} = 0.57, P = 0.643$) at 31° C (91 ± 19%), 32° C (85 ± 14%), 33° C (78 ± 15%), and 34° C (81 ± 24%). Average hatching success was 83 ± 5.5%.

**Discussion**

We verified that incubation temperature has a significant effect on sex determination in *C. latirostris*. Similar to previous reports, a 33° C incubation
temperature produced 100% males, and 31°C produced 100% females (Piña et al. 2003, 2007; Iungman and Piña 2013; Iungman et al. 2015; Parachú Marcó et al. 2015). Our information indicates that 32°C incubation temperature produces approximately 70% females and 34°C incubation temperature produces 100% males in *C. latirostris*. Prior studies additionally reported that low incubation temperatures (29 and 31°C) produce 100% females, and incubation at 34.5°C produces 60% females (Piña et al. 2003).

Inter-clutch variability in sex ratios was reported in different species when incubation temperature is within the TRT (Mrosovsky 1988; Rhen and Lang 1998; Pieau et al. 1999; Godfrey et al. 1999; Ewert and Nelson 2003). Here we showed that incubation at 32°C led to 17%, 60% and 80% females in three clutches, and 100% females in two others. Though our results are based on a relatively small sample size (25 hatchlings, four to six hatchlings per clutch), they demonstrate that factors other than mean incubation temperature can affect sex ratios: yolk estrogen levels (Elf et al. 2002; Elf 2003; Uller et al. 2009), stress level of females while follicles develop (Lovern and Wade 2003), or genetic influence (Mrosovsky and Pieau 1991; Holleley et al. 2015). Developmental rate (Webb et al. 1987), acid-base balance (Etchberger et al. 1992), and humidity (Packard and Packard 1987) also have been shown to influence TSD. We did not measure these parameters, but we think it is reasonable to assume that they were homogeneous within our experimental design.

The relationship between our controlled laboratory results and TSD in wild incubated nests is uncertain. A recent study examined the effects of climatic conditions on sex ratios produced by caimans in wild nests and determined that the mean temperature inside *C. latirostris* nests affected sex determination of hatchlings, where the mean internal temperature was close to 31°C and produced around 68% females (Simoncini et al. 2014). This sex ratio approximated the 70% of females found in the current study when incubated at 32°C under constant temperature, and it is different than 100% females produced when incubated at a constant temperature of 31°C. This is likely the result of daily and weekly variation in wild incubation temperatures compared to stable lab conditions, though the exact explanatory mechanism is yet unknown.

In this work for the first time, we tested an incubation temperature that produced both sexes within the female to male TRT for *Caiman latirostris*, and this could help to understand possible effects of future climate change. Recent climate change models predict that ambient temperatures could increase between 1.5° and 2° C by the end of the 21st Century (Intergovernmental Panel on Climate Change 2014). These proposed increases in ambient temperatures have potentially significant physiological (hatching success; Piña et al. 2007) and/or ecological (skewed population dynamics) impacts for crocodilians throughout their respective ranges (Godley et al. 2001; Mrosovsky et al. 2002; Simoncini et al. 2014). Increasing air temperatures such as this could
not only result in decreased hatching success, but may also result in sex ratio bias in TSD species (Godley et al. 2001; Mrosovsky et al. 2002; Simoncini et al. 2014). Even a 1.5° C increase on incubation temperature could produce a difference in sex ratios in wild caiman populations. If 31° C in the wild produces a sex ratio close to 32° C constant incubation treatment, and if only a 1°C increase changes the sex ratio from 70% females to 100% males, even the lowest estimated increase of 1.5° C would affect natural sex ratio toward males influencing reproduction of wild populations. There could be a modification on female behavior because of this temperature increase, but we assume that a modification of the construction of the nest is unlikely. We know that temperature during the previous week triggers nesting (Simoncini et al. 2013), so females may adjust to increasing temperature by laying eggs earlier on the season. The sex ratios of Alligator mississippiensis and Caiman crocodilus yacare hatchlings can vary from site-to-site and year-to-year depending on local climatic conditions (Campos 1993; Rhodes and Lang 1996), but they usually tend to overproduce females, and as a result, more female than male hatchlings enter the population (Lance et al. 2000). However, data indicate that some populations of juvenile and/or adult alligator (Nichols and Chabreck 1980; Lance et al. 2000) and crocodilian (Thorbjarnarson 1997) were significantly male biased. This suggests a pattern of differential mortality of females compared to males during the first years of life. In this way, an increase of temperature due to climate change could be reflected in more male hatchlings entering the population and prolification of juveniles and adults male ratio, with a consequently decrease in reproduction.

We report a delimitation of TRT between male- and female-producing temperatures that characterizes the C. latirostris population at our study site. Based on the results of this experiment, and the information cited from previous work (Piña et al. 2003), we were able to report a range of temperatures that would include the $T_{ps}$ in C. latirostris. It is interesting to note that a small temperature difference ($<0.5°$ C) may be sufficient to reach MF pivotal temperatures, as occurs in Alligator mississippiensis (Lang and Andrews 1994). This MF pivotal temperature has always been very close to the upper limit of thermal tolerance in other previously studied crocodylians: 34° C in Alligator mississippiensis; 33.5° C in Caiman crocodilus; 33° C in Crocodylus palustris, Crocodylus moreletii, Crocodylus siamensis, Crocodylus porosus, and Gavialis gangeticus, reported by Webb et al. 1987; Lang and Andrews 1994), and it could result in increased hatching mortality, a factor not assessed as part of this study.

Our work indicates that an incubation temperature of 32° C produces approximately 70% females and incubation at 34° C produces 100% males in C. latirostris. The TRT covers $>31°$ C to $<33°$ C (female to male) and $>34°$ C to $>34.5°$ C (male to female). For the first time we are able to suggest possible limits of lower and upper $T_{ps}$, for C. latirostris as $32°$ C $< T_{ps} < 33°$ C, and $34°$ C $< T_{ps} < 34.5°$ C. Because the MF transition occurs at higher incubation temperature than 34° C, and 34.5° C reduces hatching success and survivorship (Piña et al. 2003), we suggest that high temperature females constitute an overall low (possibly nonexistent) proportion of the total population.

**Acknowledgments.**—This project was funded by the Fort Collins Science Center and USGS Amphibian Research and Monitoring Initiative as a part of ongoing technical assistance to the Farm Service Agency to assess Iowa Conservation Reserve Enhancement Program wetlands. The authors thank Shawn Richmond, Matthew Lechtenberg, the field technicians, and the army of volunteers and that made this study possible. We also thank Michelle Hladik, Michael Meyer, Megan McWayne-Holmes and Corey Sanders of the USGS for the pesticide analysis, and the Amphibian Disease Diagnostic Laboratory at Washington State University for the swab analysis. We especially thank the landowners and public land managers who allowed access to wetlands (written permission prior to sampling). Exact wetland locations are proprietary. This study was performed under the auspices of Iowa State University Institutional Animal Care and Use Program wetlands. The authors thank Shawn Richmond, Matthew Lechtenberg, the field technicians, and the army of volunteers and that made this study possible. We also thank Michelle Hladik, Michael Meyer, Megan McWayne-Holmes and Corey Sanders of the USGS for the pesticide analysis, and the Amphibian Disease Diagnostic Laboratory at Washington State University for the swab analysis. We especially thank the landowners and public land managers who allowed access to wetlands (written permission prior to sampling). Exact wetland locations are proprietary. This study was performed under the auspices of Iowa State University Institutional Animal Care and Use Program wetlands.
Committee (IACUC) protocol # 3-12-7324-D, and animals were collected under Iowa state permit #3C699. This is contribution no. 572 of the USGS Amphibian Research and Monitoring Initiative. Any use of trade, firm, or product names is for descriptive purposes only and does not imply endorsement by the US Government.

Literature Cited


Research: Ethical Principles for Research with Laboratory, Farm and Wild Animals. Resolution N°1047 Anexo II. CONICET (National Scientific and Technical Research Council), Buenos Aires, Argentina.


MARÍA VIRGINIA PARACHÚ MARCÓ received her Bachelor’s degree in Biology at the Universidad Nacional del Litoral (UNL), in Santa Fe, Argentina, after which she completed her Ph.D. in Biology at the National University of Córdoba in Argentina with a specialization in Ecology, Physiology, and Ecotoxicology. Currently, she is an Assistant Researcher, National Council of Scientific & Technical Research (CONICET), Argentina. Also, she participated in research projects related to captive breeding Broad-snouted Caiman, Tegu Lizard (Salvator merianae), and Rhea (Rhea americana). (Photographed by Lucía Fernandez).

PAMELA LEIVA earned a Bachelor’s degree at the Universidad Nacional del Litoral (UNL), in Santa Fe, Argentina, and is Ph.D. student in Biology at the National Council of Scientific & Technical Research, Center of Scientific Research and Technology Transfer to Production (CONICET) in Argentina. She works in Proyecto Yacaré studying the reproduction and influence of temperature variations on the sexual proportion in Caiman latirostris in artificial conditions. Her future research interests include maternal effect and climatic factors on eggs and hatchlings survival of the Broad-snouted Caiman. (Photographed by Ezequiel Berdini).

JOSEFINA LUCIANA IUNGMAN earned a Doctoral degree in Biology from the Universidad Nacional de Rosario, Argentina. Her areas of interest include zoology, morphology, and physiology. She is a Professor in the Department of Human Morphology at Universidad Nacional del Litoral in Santa Fe, Argentina. Josefina is a member of Proyecto Yacaré. (Photographed by Gastón Iungman).

MELINA S. SIMONCINI was born in Santa Fe, Argentina. She obtained her Bachelor’s degree at the Universidad Nacional del Litoral, in Santa Fe, and a Ph.D. in Biology from the Universidad Nacional del Comahue. Melina is currently a Researcher at the National Council of Scientific & Technical Research, Center of Scientific Research and Technology Transfer to Production (CONICET) in Argentina. For the past 15 y, she has been working in Proyecto Yacaré studying the reproduction and sex determination of hatchlings of Caiman latirostris in the wild. Her research interests include artificial incubation and improving diet in captivity of Caiman latirostris. (Photographed by Luis Bassetti).

CARLOS IGNACIO PIÑA is a Professor of Ecology at the Universidad Autónoma de Entre Ríos, Argentina, and a Researcher at the National Council of Scientific & Technical Research (CONICET) in Argentina. He has a Doctoral degree from Universidad Nacional de Córdoba, Argentina, and his research interests are the biology and reproduction of the Caiman latirostris. Currently his lab is working on diet, growth, population trends, and physiology of wild and reintroduced female Caiman latirostris. (Photographed by María Virginia Parachú Marcó).