

Available online at www.sciencedirect.com

Forest Ecology and Management 184 (2003) 79–92

Forest Ecology and Management

www.elsevier.com/locate/foreco

Variation in woody vegetation among sites with different disturbance histories in the Argentine Chaco

Andrés Tálamo^{*}, Sandra M. Caziani

Facultad de Ciencias Naturales, Universidad Nacional de Salta and CONICET, Buenos Aires 177, 4400 Salta, Argentina

Received 6 July 2002; received in revised form 29 August 2002; accepted 18 March 2003

Abstract

We studied the composition and structure of the woody plant community in a logged/grazed forest, an abandoned road, a burned forest, and a primary forest as a control. The disturbances occurred 10 years prior to the study. The logged/grazed forest was similar in physiognomy to the primary forest, whereas shrubs dominated the abandoned road and burned forest. Using rarefaction techniques, the total species richness (adult, >0.5 cm diameter, and saplings, <0.5 cm diameter) was significantly highest in the logged forest. Basal area and adult plant density were similar in the logged and primary forest, and considerably higher than those of the burned forest and abandoned road, the last two types having more stems per individual. Species composition differed among communities; most notably some pioneer species were absent from the primary forest. For saplings, the abandoned road had the lowest species richness and plant density. Sapling density was highest in the logged forest due to one shrub species that was abundant in disturbed areas. Saplings of one valuable timber species, Aspidosperma quebracho-blanco, were abundant on all sites, probably due to the capacity of this species to sprout after root damage. Stem densities in the primary and logged forests were higher than on the abandoned road and in the burned forest except for the smallest diameter class (0.5– 1 cm). Logged forest tended to have higher densities, but smaller individuals than the primary forest. Considering the paucity of well-conserved areas in the Argentine Chaco, the management of extended accidental disturbance (i.e. forest fires) should be considered for long-term use and conservation planning.

 \odot 2003 Elsevier Science B.V. All rights reserved.

Keywords: Argentina; Chaco forest; Disturbance; Forest invasions; Logging; Plant diversity; Roads; Fire

1. Introduction

The Chaco is the second most extensive biome in South America, after Amazonia ([Hueck, 1978\)](#page-12-0). Semideciduous thorny forests, dry thorny forests, open forests, savannas, savannas with palms and grasslands develop on $1,000,000 \text{ km}^2$ of alluvial plain [\(Morello](#page-12-0)

Corresponding author. Tel.: +54-387-4255491; $fax: +54-387-4255483.$

[and Ada´moli, 1974\)](#page-12-0). The main floristic feature is the dominance of a tree species of the genus Schinopsis ([Prado, 1993](#page-12-0)). The area is considered of the highest priority for conservation on a regional scale ([Dinerstein](#page-11-0) [et al., 1995\)](#page-11-0). The future status of the Chaco does not appear to be any more promising than that of the Amazon basin ([Redford et al., 1990\)](#page-12-0). The Chaco forest of Argentina in particular is facing an accelerated degradation process, with replacement of the original forests by shrubs with low resource-use potential (Saravia Toledo and del Castillo, 1989; Adámoli

E-mail address: atalamo@unsa.edu.ar (A. Tálamo).

^{0378-1127/\$ –} see front matter © 2003 Elsevier Science B.V. All rights reserved. doi:10.1016/S0378-1127(03)00150-6

[et al., 1990; Red Agroforestal Chaco Argentina,](#page-12-0) [2000](#page-12-0)). During the last few decades, the most common land uses have been forestry, extensive cattle raising (with fire use in grassland management), and nonirrigated agriculture [\(Morello and Saravia Toledo,](#page-12-0) [1959a,b;](#page-12-0) [Morello and Ada´moli, 1974; Red Agroforestal](#page-12-0) [Chaco Argentina, 2000](#page-12-0)). Other frequent human-related disturbances are accidental forest fires (Adámoli, [1993](#page-11-0)) and road building, both for extraction of wood products and for petroleum prospecting [\(Protomastro](#page-12-0) [and Caziani, 1991a,b](#page-12-0); [Caziani et al., 1997](#page-11-0)). These disturbances may modify the structure and function of ecosystems ([Hobbs and Huenneke, 1992\)](#page-12-0).

Previous studies, in other forests, have shown that selective logging modifies species composition ([Fre](#page-11-0)[dericksen et al., 1999; Fredericksen and Mostacedo,](#page-11-0) [2000; Peltzer et al., 2000\)](#page-11-0), changes species diversity and density of regenerating woody plants [\(Chapman](#page-11-0) [and Chapman, 1997; Magnusson et al., 1999; Peltzer](#page-11-0) [et al., 2000; Pinard et al., 2000\)](#page-11-0), reduces canopy cover [\(Wilkie et al., 1992\)](#page-13-0), and increases the susceptibility of ecosystems to fire ([Uhl and Buschbacher,](#page-13-0) [1985](#page-13-0)).

Fire, also, reduces soil seed banks, alters plant growth rates [\(Uhl et al., 1981; Ashton and Martin,](#page-13-0) [1996](#page-13-0)), plant architecture [\(Ginocchio et al., 1994](#page-12-0)) and plant species composition [\(Zedler et al., 1983\)](#page-13-0). Moreover, frequent and more severe fires affect regeneration mechanisms [\(Hoffmann, 1998](#page-12-0)), and prolong and increase the complexity of succession patterns ([Uhl et al., 1981\)](#page-13-0). On abandoned roads, plant species richness, species composition, density and basal area, are different to those in adjacent forests [\(Guariguata](#page-12-0) [and Dupuy, 1997; Pinard et al., 2000](#page-12-0)), as well as sapling species composition [\(Hill et al., 1995](#page-12-0)). In the Argentine dry Chaco, regeneration of one of its most valuable tree species, the quebracho blanco (Aspidosperma quebracho-blanco), was impaired by traditional management practices that included extensive livestock grazing, logging, and fire ([Barchuk and](#page-11-0) Díaz, 1999).

In this study, we compared the composition, diversity and structure of woody plant communities on sites affected by different disturbances occurring 10 years previously (selective logging with livestock grazing, forest fire, and the opening of a road for petroleum prospecting) as well as primary forest with no prior record of human disturbance, as a control.

2. Methods

2.1. Study site

Copo National Park (114,000 ha, 160 m above sea level) and adjacent areas of this study are situated in northeastern Santiago del Estero Province (25°55'S, $62^{\circ}05'$ W; [Fig. 1](#page-2-0)), Argentina. The study site represents the best preserved and most extensive tract of Chaco forest in Argentina. The landscape is flat (nearly horizontal) and homogeneous, with no surface water bodies, and is vegetated by thorny, semi-deciduous forests dominated by quebracho colorado santiagueño (Schinopsis quebracho-colorado), quebracho blanco (A. quebracho-blanco) and mistol (Ziziphus mistol) (''bosques de dos quebrachos''; [Prado, 1993](#page-12-0)). The site lies in the sub-region of the ancient Juramento river basins (Morello and Adámoli, 1974), where the forests grow on inter-fluvial homogeneous soil that occupies above 90% of the total area. Belts of natural grassland occur over the sandy soils of ancient river basins ([Ocaranza, 1979](#page-12-0)). The climate is markedly seasonal, with 80% of the 700 mm average annual rainfall occurring in October–March (spring–summer).

The area was declared a National Park in 2000, with a Provincial Reserve at its western limit. In 1988 (10 years before the present study), a road for oil prospecting (10 m wide) was built in an E–W direction across the present National Park and a forest fire burned 4800 ha of primary forest, apparently burned again in following years. That same year, 1250 ha of primary forests 20 km west of the National Park were selectively logged for S. *quebracho-colorado* and A. quebracho-blanco to produce poles and railway sleepers ([Fig. 1](#page-2-0)). Considering the usual forestry use of the region (for poles, railway, charcoal and firewood), the site undergoes low to moderate intensity exploitation.

2.2. Study design

The sites studied (primary forest, logged/grazed forest, abandoned road and burned forest) are located in the inter-fluvial lands. We attempted to sample the woody community in these areas with no or very low intensity of livestock grazing. However, in logging areas, it was almost impossible to find sites without livestock.

Fig. 1. Map of study site located in Santiago del Estero province, northwestern Argentina. The four sites are indicated: primary forest, logged/ grazed forest, abandoned road and burned forest.

Although we compared non-replicable sites, we endeavored to increase sampling representation of each site by avoiding plot concentration in an area. Each site had access by two to four roads, and plots distributed in each area were at least 200 m apart. The direction of the major axis for plot allocation was sorted among eight orientations, except for the abandoned road.

The abandoned road is a straight 10 m wide path, today almost impassable and closed by vegetation growth. Center-edge heterogeneity was evident, and the edge was in turn occasionally affected by debris deposit. We chose to analyze the most homogeneous area represented by a 4 m core strip of the road center, re-colonization of which would affect migration of cattle, hunters, intruders and fires. Thus, we placed the major axis of plots along the E–W direction of the road.

Sample units were $2 m \times 100$ m plots, 12 in logged/ grazed forest, 12 in burned forest, 12 in abandoned road, and 10 in primary forest. Shrubs in the primary and logged/grazed forests were sampled within a $2 m \times 50 m$ subplot, because of their high density. The fieldwork was conducted between December 1997 and May 1999.

2.3. Measurements

The variables were defined for two different size categories:

(a) Adult plants: In each plot, we identified species and measured diameter at breast height (dbh) of all trees, and diameter of every stem >0.5 cm at 20 cm height for shrubs and trees whose stems did not reach breast height. For each plot, we

calculated species richness, density (individuals ha^{-1}), basal area (m² ha⁻¹), and mean number of stems per individual. This variable was also calculated for shrubs alone. Stems per individual were measured as number of stems >0.5 cm diameter, at breast height for trees and at 20 cm height for shrubs. Furthermore, stem density by diameter class (from 0.5 to >40 cm diameter) was calculated for each plot.

(b) Saplings: Individuals <0.5 cm diameter were considered saplings, including individuals originating both from seed and adult plant sprouts. Saplings were identified and counted by plot to estimate density and species richness.

Total species richness was calculated taking into account all the individuals in each plot (adults plus saplings).

2.4. Data analysis

We compared community diversity among sites by species rank-abundance curves ([Magurran, 1988\)](#page-12-0), using basal area for adult plants and density for saplings.

Species richness and density of both groups, basal area and number of stems per individual, were compared among sites using one-way ANOVA ([Neter et al.,](#page-12-0) [1990](#page-12-0)) with Tukey 'a posteriori' tests. Differences were considered significant at $P < 0.05$. ANOVA assumptions were satisfied after log_{10} transformation. All variables were transformed, an operation required by the majority, and enhancing adjustment to the assumptions of the others (adult and sapling species richness). For each diameter class, stem density was analyzed using Kruskal–Wallis test with multiple non-parametric comparisons ([Zar, 1999\)](#page-13-0), due to the high heterogeneity of variances even after data transformations.

Given that the number of sampled individuals can influence the number of recorded species, we compared species richness by rarefaction curves (standardized species richness). This statistical method allows an estimate of the expected species richness from randomized sub-samples of individuals in a collection or census [\(Gotelli and Graves, 1996](#page-12-0)). Curves were built by calculating mean species richness value from random samples of increasing abundance, with 1000 iterations for each abundance level, using the EcoSim program ([Gotelli and Entsminger, 2002](#page-12-0)). The program calculates a 95% confidence interval for every mean species richness value.

To test similarity of species composition among sites, multiresponse permutation procedures (MRPP) were used. This is a non-parametric multivariate technique which, unlike equivalent parametric techniques, does not require multivariate normality or homogeneity of variances [\(Zimmerman et al., 1985\)](#page-13-0).

3. Results

The logged/grazed forest was similar in physiognomy to the primary forest. Trees dominated the basal area of both the primary and logged/grazed forests, whereas shrubs dominated the basal area of the abandoned road and burned forest (Fig. 2).

Fig. 2. Species rank-abundance curves for primary forest, and areas disturbed 10 years before sampling, Santiago del Estero, Argentina. Open circles are shrub species and solid circles are tree species. PF, primary forest ($n = 10$); LF, logged/grazed forest ($n = 12$); AR, abandoned road ($n = 12$); BF, burned forest ($n = 12$).

Fig. 3. Rarefaction curves for standardized total species richness. The dotted lines correspond to the 95% confidence interval of estimated richness for logged/grazed forest.

Total standardized species richness was significantly higher in the logged/grazed forest than in the other sites $(P < 0.05)$ (Fig. 3).

3.1. Adult plants

Species richness differed among sites (ANOVA: $F_{3,42} = 11.999$, $P < 0.001$), with the burned forest lower than the other sites (Fig. 4A). Standardized species richness was highest in the logged/grazed forest ($P < 0.05$). Density differed among sites (ANOVA: $F_{3,42} = 58.493$, $P < 0.001$) with the primary and the logged/grazed forests showing similar densities, but these were three times higher than that of the other sites (Fig. 4B). Basal area was considerably different among sites (ANOVA: $F_{3,42} = 303.211$, $P < 0.001$), being similar between primary and logged/grazed forest, which were many times higher than that of the burned forest and abandoned road (Fig. 4C). The number of stems per individual differed among sites (ANOVA: $F_{3,42} = 38.596$, $P < 0.001$). Considering trees and shrubs, the burned forest and

Fig. 4. Adult plants species richness (A), density (B), basal area (C) and number of stems per individual (D) (mean + S.D.) for primary forest, and areas disturbed 10 years before sampling, Santiago del Estero, Argentina. PF, primary forest ($n = 10$); LF, logged/grazed forest ($n = 12$); AR, abandoned road ($n = 12$); BF, burned forest ($n = 12$). Means with the same letter are not significantly different at $P = 0.05$ (Tukey test).

Table 1

Mean basal area (m² ha⁻¹) \pm S.D. of adult plants in areas disturbed in 1988 and in the primary forest of the Chaco forests, Santiago del Estero, Argentina

Species	Primary forest	Logged forest	Abandoned road	Burned forest
	$(n = 10)$	$(n = 12)$	$(n = 12)$	$(n = 12)$
Trees				
A. quebracho-blanco	9.281 ± 8.891	3.428 ± 3.891	0.110 ± 0.058	0.001 ± 0.002
S. quebracho-colorado	8.196 ± 8.196	6.137 ± 8.580	0.030 ± 0.036	0.020 ± 0.022
Z. mistol	6.814 ± 7.483	5.289 ± 4.358	0.105 ± 0.283	0.010 ± 0.012
Caesalpinia paraguariensis ^a	0.060 ± 0.188	0.0002 ± 0.001	0.000	0.000
P. nigra	0.000	0.748 ± 1.197	0.000	0.001 ± 0.003
Shrubs				
Acacia sp.	0.000	0.001 ± 0.003	0.000	0.000
A. aroma ^a	0.000	0.000	0.024 ± 0.033	0.003 ± 0.010
A. furcatispina	0.464 ± 1.469	1.204 ± 1.150	0.0003 ± 0.001	0.000
Acacia praecox	2.589 ± 1.994	2.686 ± 2.827	0.367 ± 0.438	0.039 ± 0.057
Achatocarpus praecox	1.551 ± 0.881	0.420 ± 0.521	0.006 ± 0.020	0.025 ± 0.052
B. praecox	0.000	0.575 ± 0.958	0.065 ± 0.194	0.006 ± 0.022
C. atamisquea	0.806 ± 0.859	0.243 ± 0.393	0.000	0.000
C. retusa	2.859 ± 1.564	2.690 ± 1.378	1.006 ± 0.656	0.058 ± 0.044
C. salicifolia	0.123 ± 0.313	0.204 ± 0.444	0.081 ± 0.124	0.0003 ± 0.001
C. speciosa	0.109 ± 0.281	0.218 ± 0.363	0.109 ± 0.153	0.015 ± 0.020
C. tweediana	0.040 ± 0.077	0.078 ± 0.185	0.026 ± 0.048	0.066 ± 0.073
C. coccinea	0.565 ± 0.574	0.220 ± 0.395	0.317 ± 0.297	0.001 ± 0.002
C. pallida	1.993 ± 1.500	1.669 ± 0.862	0.354 ± 0.158	0.185 ± 0.151
C. australe	0.000	0.000	0.105 ± 0.203	0.000
Jodina rhombifolia	0.219 ± 0.351	0.0003 ± 0.001	0.000	0.0005 ± 0.001
Lycium sp.	0.011 ± 0.018	0.004 ± 0.008	0.015 ± 0.021	0.059 ± 0.129
Maytenus spinosa	0.113 ± 0.235	0.006 ± 0.008	0.058 ± 0.059	0.000
Mimosa detinens	0.041 ± 0.072	0.030 ± 0.045	0.137 ± 0.203	0.003 ± 0.008
P. sericantha a^a	0.000	0.009 ± 0.031	0.000	0.000
Ruprechtia triflora ^a	0.007 ± 0.023	0.181 ± 0.394	0.000	0.000
Schinus polygamus	1.396 ± 1.467	0.0002 ± 0.001	0.279 ± 0.344	0.076 ± 0.086
S. chacoënsis ^a	0.000	0.016 ± 0.051	0.004 ± 0.014	0.000
T. nodosa ^a	0.000	0.008 ± 0.026	0.000	0.000
Ximenia americana ^a	0.150 ± 0.474	0.004 ± 0.013	0.000	0.000
Total	37.386 ± 9.986	26.068 ± 10.944	3.195 ± 0.953	0.571 ± 0.259

^a Unreported species in the previous studies in the same area (Protomastro and Pelotto, unpublished data; López de Casenave et al., 1995).

the abandoned road had significantly more stems per individual than both the primary and logged/grazed forests, which were similar to each other ([Fig. 4D\)](#page-4-0).

Using basal area, species composition differed among sites (MRPP: $T = -11.34$, $P < 0.001$) (Table 1). In the primary and logged/grazed forests, species composition did not differ at the proposed 0.05 significance level, but at a very close probability (MRPP: $T = -1.689, P = 0.067$). The trees, A. quebracho-blanco, S. quebracho-colorado and Z. mistol, were the dominant species and, with the shrub Capparis retusa, represented more than 65% of basal area in both sites (Table 1). In contrast, the abandoned road and the burned forest, both dominated by shrubby vegetation, differed in species composition (MRPP: $T = -5.156, P < 0.001$ (Table 1), with C. retusa and Celtis pallida representing more than 30% of the basal area, respectively.

Species composition also differed among sites with density as a measure of abundance (MRPP: $T = -10.708$, $P < 0.001$). Comparing sites with similar physiognomy, the primary and logged/grazed forests had different species composition (MRPP: $T = -2.449, P = 0.018$; the dominant species (more Table 2

Mean density (individuals ha⁻¹) \pm S.D. of adult plants in areas disturbed in 1988 and in the primary forest of the Chaco forests, Santiago del Estero, Argentina

Species	Primary forest	Logged forest	Abandoned road	Burned forest
	$(n = 10)$	$(n = 12)$	$(n = 12)$	$(n = 12)$
Trees				
A. quebracho-blanco	500.0 ± 154.6	450.0 ± 430.1	529.2 ± 244.4	45.8 ± 39.6
S. quebracho-colorado	155.0 ± 59.9	250.0 ± 254.9	50.0 ± 47.7	66.7 ± 86.2
Z. mistol	405.0 ± 275.3	166.7 ± 124.9	41.7 ± 59.7	58.3 ± 76.4
C. paraguariensis	5.0 ± 15.8	8.3 ± 28.9	0.0	0.0
P. nigra	0.0	100.0 ± 147.7	0.0	8.3 ± 19.5
Shrubs				
Acacia sp.	0.0	25.0 ± 86.6	0.0	0.0
A. aroma	0.0	0.0	29.2 ± 33.4	8.3 ± 19.5
A. furcatispina	5.0 ± 15.8	466.7 ± 260.5	4.2 ± 14.4	0.0
Acacia praecox	910.0 ± 613.6	1366.7 ± 1129.3	250.0 ± 215.3	212.5 ± 237.5
Achatocarpus praecox	1520.0 ± 1226.4	916.7 ± 763.8	4.2 ± 14.4	91.7 ± 200.9
B. praecox	0.0	216.7 ± 298.0	54.2 ± 137.3	4.2 ± 14.4
C. atamisquea	500.0 ± 371.2	316.7 ± 340.7	0.0	0.0
C. retusa	2580.0 ± 1362.0	3566.7 ± 1172.7	1462.5 ± 905.6	600.0 ± 319.1
C. salicifolia	140.0 ± 183.8	83.3 ± 164.2	87.5 ± 104.7	8.3 ± 19.5
C. speciosa	80.0 ± 187.4	116.7 ± 185.0	87.5 ± 113.1	58.3 ± 66.9
C. tweediana	210.0 ± 440.1	175.0 ± 362.1	62.5 ± 106.9	304.2 ± 331.3
C. coccinea	230.0 ± 141.8	133.3 ± 98.5	233.3 ± 148.2	33.3 ± 38.9
C. pallida	3300.0 ± 1522.4	3100.0 ± 897.5	787.5 ± 403.5	1062.5 ± 578.5
C. australe	0.0	0.0	25.0 ± 39.9	0.0
J. rhombifolia	35.0 ± 53.0	8.3 ± 28.9	0.0	12.5 ± 31.1
Lycium sp.	70.0 ± 94.9	50.0 ± 100.0	54.2 ± 68.9	529.2 ± 1029.7
M. spinosa	180.0 ± 193.2	66.7 ± 65.1	116.7 ± 68.5	0.0
M. detinens	130.0 ± 226.3	100.0 ± 185.9	154.2 ± 216.8	12.5 ± 31.1
P. sericantha	0.0	25.0 ± 86.6	0.0	0.0
R. triflora	10.0 ± 31.6	275.0 ± 718.7	0.0	0.0
S. polygamus	280.0 ± 257.3	8.3 ± 28.9	87.5 ± 90.7	133.3 ± 103.0
S. chacoënsis	0.0	25.0 ± 45.2	4.2 ± 14.4	0.0
T. nodosa	0.0	8.3 ± 28.9	0.0	0.0
X. americana	5.0 ± 15.8	8.3 ± 28.9	0.0	0.0
Total	11250.0 ± 3274.3	12037.5 ± 2901.3	4125.0 ± 1431.2	3250.0 ± 1128.3

than 70% of total density), were the same for both sites (C. pallida, C. retusa, Achatocarpus praecox and Acacia praecox) but differed in order of importance. Species composition of the abandoned road differed from that of the burned forest (MRPP: $T = -4.391$, $P = 0.0023$ (Table 2), with a similar basal area pattern for the dominant species.

3.2. Saplings

Species richness and density differed among sites (ANOVA: $F_{3,42} = 16.057$, $P < 0.001$ and $F_{3,42} =$ 48.54, $P < 0.001$, respectively). The abandoned road

had significantly lower richness than all other sites ([Fig. 5A](#page-7-0)). However, standardized species richness of the logged/grazed forest tended to be lower than that of the other sites. The logged/grazed forest had the highest density, mainly due to Acacia praecox saplings [\(Fig. 5B\)](#page-7-0).

Species composition also varied significantly among sites (MRPP: $T = -13.418, P < 0.001$). Comparing stands of similar physiognomy, species composition differed between logged/grazed and primary forests (MRPP: $T = -7.808$, $P = 0.001$). In the primary forest, four species represented more than 80% of all sapling density, C. pallida, Acacia praecox,

 (B) PF LF **AR BF** Fig. 5. Sapling species richness (A) and density (B) (mean $+$ S.D.) for primary forest, and areas disturbed 10 years before sampling, Santiago del Estero, Argentina. PF, primary forest $(n = 10)$; LF, logged/grazed forest ($n = 12$); AR, abandoned road ($n = 12$); BF, burned forest ($n = 12$). In the density graph, gray area of the bars represents Acacia praecox density. Means with the same letter are

not significantly different at $P = 0.05$ (Tukey test).

 Ω

Achatocarpus praecox and C. retusa. In the logged/ grazed forest, 76% of saplings were Acacia praecox, which reduced the species assemblage evenness ([Figs. 2 and 5B](#page-3-0)); followed in importance by C. pallida. The species composition of the burned forest was different from that of the abandoned road (MRPP: $T = -6.126$, $P < 0.001$; however, the three dominant species were similar (C. retusa, A. quebracho-blanco and C. pallida). Among tree species, A. quebrachoblanco had the highest sampling density, and was similar in all sites [\(Table 3\)](#page-8-0).

3.3. Diameter class distributions

The abandoned road and the burned forest had higher densities of smaller stems $(0.5-1 \text{ cm})$ than the other sites, with only the density in the burned forest significantly higher than that of the primary forest (Kruskal–Wallis test: $H_c = 8.43$, $n = 46$, $P = 0.038$). In the other diameter classes, stem densities in the primary and logged/grazed forests were always higher than in the abandoned road and burned forest. The logged/grazed forest showed a tendency to higher densities of stems for the smallest classes (0.5–1 and 1–2.5 cm) and lower for the largest classes $(10-20, 20-40, 20)$ and >40 cm than the primary forest ([Fig. 6\)](#page-9-0), although not statistically significant. Maximum stem diameters were 68.7 cm in the primary forest, 73.2 cm in the secondary forest, 13 cm in the abandoned road, and 2.5 cm in the burned forest.

4. Discussion

Our results show that the actual state of vegetation differs significantly among the four sites, each with a different history of disturbance. Sampling represented extensive disturbed areas, but studies designed at a larger scale, including site replication, would be necessary to objectively associate the present conditions of vegetation structure and composition to disturbance. However, the finding of true replicates for fire events of such magnitude, roads built up and abandoned and plots that had been selectively logged in the same time period, allowing coincidental periods of recovery, appears to be practically impossible. Taking into account the homogeneity of the study area with regard to soil conditions, topography and vegetation composition, the differences observed are probably an effect of the disturbances.

The loss of forest physiognomy has been previously related to misuse of natural resources in the Chaco forest ([Morello and Saravia Toledo, 1959a](#page-12-0)), and appears to be one of the most conspicuous and apparently irreversible changes caused by intense disturbance regimes. In our study, the intensively disturbed sites (abandoned road and burned forest) resulted in a shrub–grassland physiognomy. In 10 years, the abandoned road and the burned forest had recovered 9 and 1.5%, respectively, of basal area compared to the primary forest, suggesting that the recovery process evolves slowly. Old prospecting roads (abandoned several decades ago) are visible in recent satellite images of the study area (LANDSAT TM) due to long-term structural alteration (personal observation; [Thren and Zerda, 1994](#page-13-0)). In Malaysian forests, roads abandoned 15 years after logging were still visible as corridors and patches of smaller trees ([Pinard et al.,](#page-12-0) [1996](#page-12-0)). The burned area in this study was mainly colonized by annual herbs, which in turn provide

C

BF

d

Table 3

Sapling mean density (individuals ha^{-1}) \pm S.D. in areas disturbed in 1988 and in the primary forest of the Chaco forests, Santiago del Estero, Argentina

Species	Primary forest	Logged forest $(n = 12)$	Abandoned road $(n = 12)$	Burned forest $(n = 12)$
	$(n = 10)$			
Trees				
A. quebracho-blanco	160.0 ± 171.3	225.0 ± 148.5	108.3 ± 94.9	258.3 ± 179.4
S. quebracho-colorado	20.0 ± 42.2	25.0 ± 45.2	16.7 ± 32.6	4.2 ± 14.4
Z. mistol	30.0 ± 48.3	33.3 ± 65.1	4.2 ± 14.4	25.0 ± 50.0
C. paraguariensis	0.0	75.0 ± 142.2	0.0	0.0
P. nigra	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0
Shrubs				
Acacia sp.	0.0	8.3 ± 28.9	0.0	0.0
A. aroma	0.0	0.0	0.0	4.2 ± 14.4
A. furcatispina	0.0	158.3 ± 242.9	0.0	0.0
Acacia praecox	1150.0 ± 1195.6	14558.3 ± 16325.9	16.7 ± 32.6	83.3 ± 242.5
Achatocarpus praecox	520.0 ± 282.1	658.3 ± 862.8	0.0	0.0
B. praecox	0.0	33.3 ± 88.8	4.2 ± 14.4	0.0
C. atamisquea	50.0 ± 97.2	50.0 ± 79.8	0.0	0.0
C. retusa	470.0 ± 302.0	783.3 ± 674.0	158.3 ± 203.2	670.8 ± 420.7
C. salicifolia	10.0 ± 31.6	8.3 ± 28.9	4.2 ± 14.4	37.5 ± 74.2
C. speciosa	40.0 ± 84.3	66.7 ± 172.3	4.2 ± 14.4	37.5 ± 71.1
C. tweediana	70.0 ± 188.9	16.7 ± 57.7	4.2 ± 14.4	50.0 ± 92.9
C. coccinea	190.0 ± 172.9	266.7 ± 218.8	4.2 ± 14.4	41.7 ± 51.5
C. pallida	1490.0 ± 1613.4	1391.7 ± 766.9	75.0 ± 54.4	229.2 ± 172.5
C. australe	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0
J. rhombifolia	20.0 ± 42.2	16.7 ± 38.9	0.0	12.5 ± 22.6
Lycium sp.	40.0 ± 69.9	25.0 ± 62.2	8.3 ± 19.5	104.2 ± 233.0
M. spinosa	120.0 ± 198.9	325.0 ± 313.7	62.5 ± 60.8	62.5 ± 64.4
M. detinens	10.0 ± 31.6	141.7 ± 242.9	8.3 ± 19.5	4.2 ± 14.4
P. sericantha	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0
R. triflora	0.0	150.0 ± 350.3	0.0	0.0
S. polygamus	40.0 ± 51.6	0.0	0.0	8.33 ± 19.46
S. chacoënsis	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0
T. nodosa	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0
X. americana	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0
Total	4430.0 ± 1931.1	19016.7 ± 16595.2	479.2 ± 362.7	1633.3 ± 776.4

abundant burning material during dry seasons (winter), similar to what occurs in the Bolivian forests ([Fredericksen, 2000](#page-11-0)). This may have facilitated the subsequent fire outbreaks (local information, personal communication), delaying invasion of woody species with respect to herbaceous vegetation. Adámoli [\(1993\)](#page-11-0), [Morello and Saravia Toledo \(1959a\)](#page-12-0), and Adámoli et al. (1990) consider fire and over-grazing to be determinant factors of the woody/weedy biomass ratio in the Chaco forests. In California shrublands, frequent grassland fires virtually eliminate some shrub species, considerably delaying the re-invasion of shrubs and increasing the probability of recurrent fires [\(Zedler et al., 1983\)](#page-13-0). If the recurrent fire regime remains in place, a change in species composition can be expected, favoring species with vegetative reproduction (Adámoli, 1993; Hoffmann, 1998). Our field observations showed that A. quebracho-blanco, Acacia praecox, C. retusa, C. tweediana, C. pallida, S. quebracho-colorado, Capparis atamisquea and Castela coccinea can sprout after damage; and the first six species dominated the burned forest both as adults and saplings [\(Tables 2 and 3](#page-6-0)).

Selective logging may modify species composition, promoting installation and increasing density of shade intolerant species [\(Fredericksen and Mostacedo, 2000;](#page-11-0)

Fig. 6. Stem density (mean $+$ S.D.) by diameter class from 0.5 to >40 cm diameter for primary forest, and areas disturbed 10 years before sampling, Santiago del Estero, Argentina. PF, primary forest ($n = 10$); LF, logged/grazed forest ($n = 12$); AR, abandoned road ($n = 12$); BF, burned forest ($n = 12$). Within each diameter class, sites with the same letter are not significantly different at $P = 0.05$ (non-parametric multiple comparison for Kruskal–Wallis test; [Zar, 1999\)](#page-13-0).

[Peltzer et al., 2000](#page-11-0)). In our study, the greater species richness in the logged/grazed forest was due to the addition of species such as Prosopis nigra, Senna chacoënsis (associated to degraded and saline sites; [Morello and Saravia Toledo, 1959a; Sarmiento, 1963\)](#page-12-0), Prosopis sericantha (halophytic; Adámoli et al., [1972](#page-11-0)), Bougainvillea praecox and Tabebuia nodosa. However, we cannot deny the possibility of this variability being partially related to other differences among sites. The species richness in the abandoned road and burned forest was similar to that of the primary forest, although some species replacement took place. Pioneer species, found in the abandoned road and burned forest, were absent from the primary forest (P. nigra, Acacia aroma, Acacia furcatispina, B. praecox, Cercidium australe, S. chacoënsis). These species often occur in open and disturbed areas, and P. nigra and A. aroma are dispersed by cattle [\(Morello](#page-12-0) [and Saravia Toledo, 1959a; Sarmiento, 1963\)](#page-12-0). A different species composition in roads, with a prevalence of pioneer species at roadsides, was also observed in Malaysian forests ([Pinard et al., 2000](#page-12-0)).

Notwithstanding self-thinning mechanisms, the higher number of stems per individual in the abandoned road and in the burned forest could affect the physiognomy of the regenerated community. In Chilean shrublands, [Ginocchio et al. \(1994\)](#page-12-0) observed plant architecture changes in response to fire. Some shrub species developed more and longer buds. Fire and cutting could directly affect the form of growth by activating secondary buds [\(Morello and Saravia](#page-12-0) [Toledo, 1959a\)](#page-12-0), or indirectly affect it by relaxing intraindividual competition. In the same study area, both natural forest–grassland edges and logged/grazed forests are characterized by higher small-stem densities (<2.5 cm diameter) and by the presence of species associated with open areas (López de Casenave et al., [1995](#page-12-0); Protomastro and Pelotto, unpublished data). Our conclusions are similar, since the logged/grazed forest showed a tendency towards a higher density of small stems in comparison to the primary forest [\(Fig. 6](#page-9-0)), and species common in natural forest–grassland edges areas were absent in the primary forest (e.g. Prosopis sp., A. furcatispina).

The high density of saplings in the logged/grazed forest far exceeds that of the primary forest. This higher density was explained by one species only, Acacia praecox. This species tends to expand and increase in density in disturbed areas ([Morello and](#page-12-0) [Saravia Toledo, 1959a; Sarmiento, 1963; Protomastro,](#page-12-0) [1988](#page-12-0)), as well as in natural forest–grassland border areas (López de Casenave et al., 1995). However, Acacia praecox saplings were not abundant in more disturbed and open sites, probably because they are sensitive to frost exposure [\(Protomastro, 1988\)](#page-12-0). [Kuusipalo et al. \(1998\)](#page-12-0) also found a markedly high density of saplings in logged forests in comparison to a control, whereas [Chapman and Chapman \(1997\)](#page-11-0) found no differences in sapling density between the logged and control forests 25 years after disturbance. Considering only tree species, sapling density of A. quebracho-blanco was higher and similar in all sites, probably explained by its ability to sprout after root damage (Barchuk and Díaz, 1999).

The lower sapling density and species richness found on the abandoned road could be related to a low recruitment rate, due to: (a) soil compaction caused by use of heavy machinery ([Pinard et al.,](#page-12-0) [1996; Guariguata and Dupuy, 1997\)](#page-12-0); (b) greater surface erosion leading to topsoil removal (personal observation); (c) microclimatic conditions generated by road building (high soil temperatures and solar radiation, low moisture and nutrient content), limiting the establishment and survival of saplings ([Pinard](#page-12-0) [et al., 1996](#page-12-0)); and (d) grazing and trampling by livestock, exerting a negative pressure on some already established species (Sarmiento, 1963; Adámoli et al., [1972; Pinard et al., 1996; Barchuk et al., 1998\)](#page-12-0), increasing compaction ([Abril et al., 1993; Grulke,](#page-11-0) 1994; Abensperg-Traun et al., 1996; Martín et al., [1998](#page-11-0)), which would reduce infiltration [\(Smith et al.,](#page-12-0) [1996; Abril and Bucher, 1999](#page-12-0)), increasing soil exposure [\(Bullock and Pakeman, 1977; Grulke, 1994](#page-11-0)) and modifying contributions to the soil and nutrient cycle ([Abril et al., 1993](#page-11-0)).

In addition to the changes in species composition and structure, the potential for indirect impact appears to be high. Selective logging could indirectly lead to

other disturbances: (a) opening and transit of roads for logging, and forest fragmentation ([Thren and Zerda,](#page-13-0) [1994\)](#page-13-0); and (b) introduction of livestock [\(Morello and](#page-12-0) [Saravia Toledo, 1959b](#page-12-0)).

The use of heavy machinery on extraction roads causes soil compaction, possibly compromising species recruitment [\(Pinard et al., 1996; Guariguata and Dupuy,](#page-12-0) [1997; Whitman et al., 1998](#page-12-0)). Despite the smaller surface they affect directly (i.e. 0.02% in the Copo National Park), roads are corridors for occurrence and propagation of other disturbances, such as illegal logging, furtive hunting, human colonization, fire from human ignition sources, and invasion of exotic species ([Uhl and Buschbacher, 1985; Wilkie et al., 1992;](#page-13-0) [Guariguata and Dupuy, 1997; Fredericksen, 2000; Putz](#page-13-0) [et al., 2000; Putz et al., 2001](#page-13-0)). In the study area and close vicinity, the network of oil prospecting roads has simplified the illegal extraction of natural products, the settlement of livestock grazing posts ([Protomastro and](#page-12-0) [Caziani, 1991a,b](#page-12-0)), invasion of exotics (i.e. the fodder spp. Panicum maximum var. Gatoon panic; Derlindati, personal communication), movement of livestock and fire transmission (personal observation); and some of these petroleum prospecting roads have been transformed into permanent roads (i.e. del Límite Road, Balcanera Road and Olmos Road; [Fig. 1\)](#page-2-0).

Logged forests are generally richer in species than the primary forest ([Putz et al., 2000\)](#page-12-0). Besides species richness, other variables such as physiognomy, plant growth form and species identity (with variable vulnerability and value for wildlife, [Pinard et al., 1999\)](#page-12-0) should also be considered as indicators of the community status. Structural variables at community and landscape scales should be used, too, as indicators of biodiversity for sustainable forest management ([Lindenmayer et al., 2000\)](#page-12-0). In our case, the most intensely disturbed sites had species richness levels similar to that of the primary forest, but differed in physiognomy, composition and structure. Although basal area was statistically similar in primary and logged forests, there are differences in the distribution of the variable among shrubs and trees. Shrubs represented 34% of total basal area in primary forest and 44% in logged/grazed forest. Unpublished data on the vertical structure show significant differences in stem and leaf densities at 0–2 m (higher values in logged forest) and above 10 m (higher values in primary forest) (Derlindati and Caziani, unpublished data).

At landscape level, the studied disturbances created patches of different succession stages, physiognomy and species composition, increasing the beta and gamma diversity of the system, but altering large areas of the plant community of highest conservation value: S. quebracho-colorado and A. quebracho-blanco forest ([Prado, 1993](#page-12-0)).

In view of the paucity of well-conserved areas in the semiarid Argentine Chaco forest [\(Redford et al.,](#page-12-0) [1990](#page-12-0)), the management of extended accidental disturbances (i.e. forest fires), and the cost/benefit ratio of different land uses in this region should be taken into account for long-term use and conservation planning.

Acknowledgements

This study was carried out thanks to contributions from FA97 World Wildlife Fund (S.M. Caziani), Project 752 from Consejo de Investigación de la Universidad Nacional de Salta (CIUNSa) (S.M. Caziani), PEI 809 of Consejo Nacional de Investigaciones Científicas y Técnicas (CONICET) (S.M. Caziani) and a Doctoral Fellowship from CONICET (A. Tálamo). We are very grateful to T. Fredericksen, J. Blake, J. Pérez-Éman, J. López de Casenave, P. Feinsinger, K. Redford and two anonymous reviewers for insightful critiques of this manuscript; A.L. Sureda and Mónica S. Cassels for the translation of the original Spanish text into English; and S.M. Pérez de Bianchi for vegetable anatomy comments. C. Trucco gave invaluable collaboration during all the fieldwork; also E.J. Derlindati, D. Ramallo and H. Orce, who participated of some field trips. M. Fabrezi (Director of the Museo de Ciencias Naturales, Universidad Nacional de Salta) provided the vehicle for the field trips. G. Moisés and Estancia Juramento personnel helped with transportation in the field. We thank A. Olsen for her statistical advice, H. Almaraz (Forest Direction of Santiago del Estero Province) for valuable information on logging history in the area, and Boni Pérez and family for their hospitality.

References

Abensperg-Traun, M., Smith, G.T., Arnold, G.W., Steven, D.E., 1996. The effects of habitat fragmentation and livestockgrazing on animal communities in remnants of gimlet Eucalyptus salubris woodland in the Western Australian wheatbelt. I. Arthropods. J. Appl. Ecol. 33, 1281–1301.

- Abril, A., Bucher, E.H., 1999. The effects of overgrazing on soil microbial community and fertility in the Chaco dry savannas of Argentina. Appl. Soil Ecol. 12, 159–167.
- Abril, A., Acosta, M., Bachmeier, O., Rollan, A., 1993. Efecto de la cobertura vegetal sobre la actividad biológica de un suelo del Chaco Árido. Rev. Arg. Microbiol. 25, 15–26.
- Adámoli, J., 1993. Análisis ecológico del fuego a escalas regional y local. In: Kunst, C., Sipowicz, A., Maceira, N., Bravo, S. (Eds.), Ecología y Manejo de Fuego en Ecosistemas Naturales y Modificados. Memoria del Seminario-Taller, Instituto Nacional de Tecnología Agropecuaria, Argentina, pp. 1–7.
- Adámoli, J., Neumann, R., Ratier de Colina, A.D., Morello, J., 1972. El Chaco aluvional salteño. Revista de Investigaciones Agropecuarias 9 (5), 165–237.
- Adámoli, J., Sennhauser, E., Acero, J., Rescia, A., 1990. Stress and disturbance: vegetation dynamics in the dry Chaco region of Argentina. J. Biogeogr. 17, 491–500.
- Ashton, D.H., Martin, D.G., 1996. Regeneration in pole-stage forest of Eucalyptus regnans subjected to different fire intensities in 1982. Aust. J. Bot. 44, 393–410.
- Barchuk, A.H., Díaz, M.P., 1999. Regeneration and structure of Aspidosperma quebracho-blanco Schl. in the arid Chaco (Córdoba, Argentina). For. Ecol. Manage. 118, 31-36.
- Barchuk, A.H., Díaz, M.P., Casanoves, F., Balzarini, M.G., Karlin, U.O., 1998. Experimental study on survival rates in two arboreal species from the Argentinean dry Chaco. For. Ecol. Manage. 103, 203–210.
- Bullock, J.M., Pakeman, R.J., 1977. Grazing on lowland heath in England: management methods and their effects on heathland vegetation. Biol. Conserv. 79, 1–13.
- Caziani, S.M., Marconi, P., Aguilera, N., 1997. Proyecto de conservación de la Biodiversidad APN/GEF/BIRF. Area Protegida Copo. Informe Final. Administración de Parques Nacionales, Argentina.
- Chapman, C.A., Chapman, L.J., 1997. Forest regeneration in logged and unlogged forest of Kibale National Park. Uganda Biotropica 29 (4), 396–412.
- Dinerstein, E., Olson, D.M., Graham, D.J., Webster, A.L., Primm, S.A., Bookbinder, M.P., Ledec, G., 1995. Una Evaluación del Estado de Conservación de las Eco-regiones Terrestres de América Latina y el Caribe. Publicado en colaboración con el Fondo Mundial para al Naturaleza. Banco Mundial, Washington, DC.
- Fredericksen, T.S., 2000. Logging and conservation of tropical forests in Bolivia. Int. For. Rev. 2 (4), 271–278.
- Fredericksen, T.S., Mostacedo, B., 2000. Regeneration of timber species following selective logging in a Bolivian tropical dry forest. For. Ecol. Manage. 131, 47–55.
- Fredericksen, T.S., Ross, B.D., Hoffman, W., Morrison, M.L., Beyea, J., Johnson, B.N., Lester, M.B., Ross, E., 1999. Short-term understory plant community responses to timberharvesting intensity on non-industrial private forestlands in Pennsylvania. For. Ecol. Manage. 116, 129–139.
- Ginocchio, R., Holmgren, M., Montenegro, G., 1994. Effect of fire on plant architecture in Chilean shrubs. Revista Chilena de Historia Natural 67, 177–182.
- Gotelli, N.J., Entsminger, G.L., 2002. EcoSim: Null Models Software for Ecology, version 7. Acquired Intelligence Inc. & Kesey-Bear, Burlington, VT 05465, USA. [http://www.homepages.together.net/](HTTP://WWW.HOMEPAGES.TOGETHER.NET/~GENTSMIN/ECOSIM.HTM) \sim [gentsmin/ecosim.htm](HTTP://WWW.HOMEPAGES.TOGETHER.NET/~GENTSMIN/ECOSIM.HTM).
- Gotelli, N.J., Graves, G.R., 1996. Null Models in Ecology. Smithsonian Institution Press, Washington, DC.
- Grulke, M., 1994. Propuesta de manejo silvopastoril en el Chaco Salteño. Quebracho 2, 5-13.
- Guariguata, M.R., Dupuy, J.M., 1997. Forest regeneration in abandoned logging roads in lowland Costa Rica. Biotropica 29 (1), 15–28.
- Hill, J.D., Canham, C.D., Wood, D.M., 1995. Patterns and causes of resistance to tree invasion in rights-of-way. Ecol. Appl. 5 (2), 459–470.
- Hobbs, R.J., Huenneke, L.F., 1992. Disturbance, diversity and invasion: implications for conservation. Conserv. Biol. 6, 324–337.
- Hoffmann, W.A., 1998. Post-burn reproduction of woody plants in a neotropical savanna: the relative importance of sexual and vegetative reproduction. J. Appl. Ecol. 35, 422–433.
- Hueck, K., 1978. Los Bosques de Sudamérica. Sociedad Alemana de Cooperación Técnica (GTZ), Eschborn, Alemania, 255 pp.
- Kuusipalo, J., Jafarsidik, Y., Ådjers, G., Tuomela, K., 1998. Population dynamics of tree seedlings in a mixed dipterocarp rainforest before and after logging and crown liberation. For. Ecol. Manage. 81 (1–3), 85–94.
- Lindenmayer, D.B., Margules, C.R., Botkin, D.B., 2000. Indicators of biodiversity for ecologically sustainable forest management. Conserv. Biol. 14, 941–950.
- López de Casenave, J., Pelotto, J.P., Protomastro, J.J., 1995. Edgeinterior differences in vegetation structure and composition in a Chaco semiarid forest, Argentina. For. Ecol. Manage. 72, 61–69.
- Martín B., Zerpa, G., Sosa, O., Denoia, J., 1998. Efecto del tránsito animal sobre las propiedades físicas del suelo y sobre la velocidad de infiltración. XVI Congreso Arg. de la Ciencia del Suelo, Villa Carlos Paz, pp. 11–13.
- Magnusson, W.E., de Lima, O.P., Reis, F.Q., Higuchi, N., Ferreira Ramos, J.F., 1999. Logging activity and tree regeneration in an Amazonian forest. For. Ecol. Manage. 113, 67–74.
- Magurran, A.E., 1988. Ecological Diversity and its Measurement. University Press, Cambridge.
- Morello, J., Adámoli, J., 1974. Las grandes unidades de vegetación y ambiente del Chaco argentino. Segunda Parte: Vegetación y ambiente de la Provincia del Chaco. INTA Serie Fitogeográfica 13.
- Morello, J., Saravia Toledo, C., 1959a. El bosque chaqueño I. Paisaje primitivo, paisaje natural y paisaje cultural en el oriente de Salta. Revista Agronómica del Noroeste Argentino 3, 5-81.
- Morello, J., Saravia Toledo, C., 1959b. El bosque chaqueño II. La ganadería y el bosque en el oriente de Salta. Paisaje primitivo, paisaje natural y paisaje cultural en el oriente de Salta. Revista Agronómica del Noroeste Argentino 3, 209-258.
- Neter, J., Wasserman, W., Kutner, M.H., 1990. Applied Linear Statistical Models. Regression, Analysis of Variance and Experimental Design. Irwin, USA.
- Ocaranza, A.O., 1979. Estudios de suelos. Area: ''Canal de Dios'' (Provincia Santiago del Estero). Proyecto NOA Hídrico. Desarrollo de los recursos hídricos del noroeste. Segunda Fase. INCYTH. CFI, Subsecretaría de Recursos Hídricos. Programa de las Naciones Unidas para el desarrollo.
- Peltzer, D.P., Bast, M.L., Wilson, S.D., Gerry, A.K., 2000. Plant diversity and tree responses following contrasting disturbances in boreal forest. For. Ecol. Manage. 127, 191–203.
- Pinard, M., Howlett, B., Davidson, D., 1996. Site conditions limits pioneer tree recruitment after logging of dipterocarp forest in Sabah, Malaysia. Biotropica 28 (1), 2–12.
- Pinard, M.A., Putz, F.E., Rumíz, D., Guzmán, R., Jardim, A., 1999. Ecological characterization of tree species for guiding forest management decisions in seasonally dry forests in Lomerío, Bolivia. For. Ecol. Manage. 113, 201–213.
- Pinard, M.A., Barker, M.G., Tay, J., 2000. Soil disturbance and post-logging forest recovery on bulldozer paths in Sabah, Malaysia. For. Ecol. Manage. 130, 213–225.
- Prado, D.E., 1993. What is the Gran Chaco vegetation in South America? I. A review. Contribution to the study of flora and vegetation of the Chaco. V. Candollea 48, 145–172.
- Protomastro, J.J., 1988. Fenología y mecanismos de interacción en el bosque de quebracho colorado, blanco y mistol. Tesis doctoral, Facultad de Ciencias Exactas y Naturales, Universidad de Buenos Aires, Buenos Aires, Argentina.
- Protomastro, J.J., Caziani, S.M., 1991a. Evaluación de Impacto Ambiental de la Prospección Petrolífera en la Cuenca noreste: bloques Monte Quemado, El Caburé y Campo Gallo. Informe Interno para Expopetrol S.A.
- Protomastro, J.J., Caziani, S.M., 1991b. Impacto ambiental de las actividades de prospección petrolífera: Pozo X-1, SP 910, Línea 44104, Los Tigres (Sgo. del Estero). Petrol S.A.
- Putz, F.E., Redford, K.H., Robinson, J.G., Fimbel, R., Blate, G.M., 2000. Biodiversity conservation in the context of tropical forest management. Environment Paper 75, Biodiversity Series, Impact Studies 1. The World Bank, Washington, DC.
- Putz, F.E., Blate, G.M., Redford, K.H., Fimbel, R., Robinson, J., 2001. Tropical forest management and conservation of biodiversity: an overview. Conserv. Biol. 15 (1), 7–20.
- Red Agroforestal Chaco Argentina, 2000. Estudio Integral de la Región del Parque Chaqueño. Proyecto Bosques Nativos y Areas Protegidas. Secretaría de Desarrollo Sustentable y Política Ambiental, Argentina.
- Redford, K.H., Taber, A., Simonetti, J.A., 1990. There is more to biodiversity than the tropical rain forest. Conserv. Biol. 4 (3), 328–330.
- Saravia Toledo, C., del Castillo, E., 1989. Aplicación de sistemas de uso múltiple en los bosques del chaco semiárido argentino. V. Jornadas Técnicas: uso múltiple del bosque y sistemas agroforestales, Eldorado, Misiones, Argentina.
- Sarmiento, G., 1963. Las comunidades vegetales del chaco semiárido santiagueño. Tesis doctoral, Facultad de Cs. Exactas y Naturales, Universidad de Buenos Aires, Buenos Aires, Argentina.
- Smith, G.T., Arnold, G.W., Sarre, S., Abensperg-Traun, M., Steven, D.E., 1996. The effects of habitat fragmentation and livestockgrazing on animal communities in remnants of gimlet Eucalyptus

salubris woodland in the Western Australian wheatbelt. II. Lizards. J. Appl. Ecol. 33, 1302–1310.

- Thren, M., Zerda, H.R., 1994. Inventario Forestal de la Provincia de Santiago del Estero, Departamentos Copo y Alberdi. Final Report. Convenio: Provincia de Santiago del Estero, Consejo Federal de Inversiones (CFI), Universidad Nacional de Sgo. del Estero, Agencia Alemana de Cooperación Técnica (GTZ), Facultad de Cs. Forestales y Asociación Cooperadora de la Fac. de Cs. Forestales.
- Uhl, C., Buschbacher, R., 1985. A disturbing synergism between cattle ranch burning practices and selective tree harvesting in the eastern Amazon. Biotropica 17 (4), 265–268.
- Uhl, C., Clark, K., Clark, H., Murphy, P., 1981. Early plant succession after cutting and burning in the upper Rio Negro region of the Amazon basin. J. Ecol. 69, 631–649.
- Whitman, A.A., Brokaw, V.L., Hagan, J.M., 1998. Forest damage caused by selective logging of mahogany (Swietenia macrophylla) in northern Belize. For. Ecol. Manage. 92 (1–3), 87–96.
- Wilkie, D.S., Sidle, J.G., Boundzanga, G.C., 1992. Mechanized logging, market hunting and a bank loan in Congo. Conserv. Biol. 6 (4), 50–580.
- Zar, J., 1999. Biostatical Analysis, 4th ed. Prentice-Hall, New Jersey.
- Zedler, P.H., Gautier, C.R., McMaster, G.S., 1983. Vegetation changes response to extreme events: the effect of the short interval between fires in California chaparral and coastal scrub. Ecology 64 (4), 809–818.
- Zimmerman, G.M., Goetz, H., Mielke, P.W., 1985. Use of an improved statistical method for group comparisons to study effects of prairie fire. Ecology 66 (2), 606–611.