

Comment

Reply to “Comment on “Free-Radical Formation by the Peroxidase-like Catalytic Activity of MFeO (M = Fe, Ni and Mn) Nanoparticules.””

Ana Carolina Moreno Maldonado, Elin L Winkler, Mariana Raineri, Alfonso Toro Cordova, Luis M. Rodriguez, Horacio E. Troiani, Mary Luz Mojica Piscioti, Marcelo Vasquez Mansilla, Dina Tobia, Marcela S Nadal, Teobaldo Torres, Emilio De Biasi, Carlos A. Ramos, Gerardo F. Goya, Roberto D Zysler, and Enio Lima

J. Phys. Chem. C, **Just Accepted Manuscript** • DOI: 10.1021/acs.jpcc.9b09804 • Publication Date (Web): 22 Oct 2019

Downloaded from pubs.acs.org on November 2, 2019

Just Accepted

“Just Accepted” manuscripts have been peer-reviewed and accepted for publication. They are posted online prior to technical editing, formatting for publication and author proofing. The American Chemical Society provides “Just Accepted” as a service to the research community to expedite the dissemination of scientific material as soon as possible after acceptance. “Just Accepted” manuscripts appear in full in PDF format accompanied by an HTML abstract. “Just Accepted” manuscripts have been fully peer reviewed, but should not be considered the official version of record. They are citable by the Digital Object Identifier (DOI®). “Just Accepted” is an optional service offered to authors. Therefore, the “Just Accepted” Web site may not include all articles that will be published in the journal. After a manuscript is technically edited and formatted, it will be removed from the “Just Accepted” Web site and published as an ASAP article. Note that technical editing may introduce minor changes to the manuscript text and/or graphics which could affect content, and all legal disclaimers and ethical guidelines that apply to the journal pertain. ACS cannot be held responsible for errors or consequences arising from the use of information contained in these “Just Accepted” manuscripts.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7 Reply to “Comment on “Free-Radical Formation by
8
9
10
11 the Peroxidase-like Catalytic Activity of MFe_2O_4 (M
12
13
14
15 = Fe, Ni and Mn) Nanoparticules.””
16
17
18
19

20 *Ana Carolina Moreno Maldonado^a, Elin L. Winkler^{b,c}, Mariana Raineri^c, Alfonso Toro*
21
22 *Córdova^a, Luis M. Rodríguez^c, Horacio E. Troiani^{b,d}, Mary Luz Mojica Piscioti^b, Marcelo*
23
24 *Vasquez Mansilla^c, Dina Tobia^c, Marcela S. Nadal^c, Teobaldo E. Torres^c, Emilio De Biasi^c,*
25
26 *Carlos A. Ramos^c, Gerardo F. Goya^{a,e}, Roberto D. Zysler^{b,c}, Enio Lima Jr.^{c,*}*
27
28
29

30 ^a Instituto de Nanociencia de Aragón (INA), Universidad de Zaragoza, 50018 Zaragoza, Spain.
31
32

33
34 ^b Instituto Balseiro, Universidad Nacional de Cuyo – CNEA, 8400, S. C. Bariloche, RN,
35
36 Argentina.
37
38

39 ^c Instituto de Nanociencia y Nanotecnología, CNEA, CONICET, Centro Atómico Bariloche,
40
41 8400, S. C. Bariloche, Argentina.
42
43
44

45 ^d Grupo de Caracterización de Materiales y Óxidos No-Estequiométricos, Gerencia de
46
47 Investigación Aplicada, CNEA, CONICET, Centro Atómico Bariloche, 8400, S. C. Bariloche,
48
49 Argentina.
50
51

52
53 ^e Departamento de Física de la Materia Condensada, Facultad de Ciencias, Universidad de
54
55 Zaragoza, 50009 Zaragoza, Spain.
56
57
58
59
60

1
2
3 Abstract
4

5 Recently we have reported a qualitative, quantitative and reproducible study of the generation of
6 free radicals as a result of the surface catalytic activity of Fe_3O_4 , Fe_2O_3 , MnFe_2O_4 and NiFe_2O_4
7 nanoparticles as a function of the $\text{Fe}^{2+}/\text{Fe}^{3+}$ oxidation state under different pHs (4.8 and 7.4) and
8 temperatures (25 °C and 40 °C) condition. These results were contrasted with those obtained
9 from the *in vitro* experiments in BV2 cells incubated with dextran-coated magnetic
10 nanoparticles. Based on these results we affirm that our ferrite magnetic nanoparticles catalyze
11 the formation of free radicals and the decomposition of H_2O_2 by a ‘peroxidase-like’ activity. B.
12 In a comment on this article, Meunier and A. Robert question two points: First they assert that
13 the measured free radicals are not produced by a peroxidase reaction. Also, based on a different
14 normalization method from those reported in our work, they also discuss that the reaction is not
15 catalytic. Here we reply the arguments of the authors about these two points.
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28
29
30
31
32
33
34
35
36
37
38
39

40 Recently we have reported a qualitative, quantitative and reproducible study of the generation of
41 free radicals as a result of the surface catalytic activity of Fe_3O_4 , Fe_2O_3 , MnFe_2O_4 and NiFe_2O_4
42 nanoparticles as a function of the $\text{Fe}^{2+}/\text{Fe}^{3+}$ oxidation state. The study was performed by Electron
43 Paramagnetic Resonance (EPR) Spectroscopy under different pHs (4.8 and 7.4) and temperatures
44 (25 °C and 40 °C) condition. These results were contrasted with those obtained from the *in vitro*
45 experiments in BV2 cells incubated with dextran-coated magnetic nanoparticles. Based on these
46 results we affirm that ferrite magnetic nanoparticles catalyze the formation of free radicals and
47
48
49
50
51
52
53
54
55
56
57
58
59
60

1
2
3 the decomposition of H_2O_2 producing reactive oxygen species (ROS) by a ‘peroxidase-like’
4 activity.¹
5
6

7
8 In the comment,² B. Meunier and A. Robert question two points: First they assert that the
9 measured free radicals are not produced by a peroxidase reaction. Also, based on a different
10 normalization method from those reported in our work, they also discuss that the reaction is not
11 catalytic.
12
13
14
15

16
17 Related to the first point, we agree with the authors that it is not a peroxidase reaction, *sensu*
18 *strictu*, that produced the free radicals observed in our work. It is evident that many conditions of
19 a typical peroxidase reaction could not be present (e.g., no enzymes or haem groups participate
20 in our reactions) or were not used (e.g., a peroxidase substrate). For this reason, we adopted the
21 term ‘peroxidase-like’ reaction, defined more than 20 years ago³ and widely used in the scientific
22 literature since then⁴. Within the context of inorganic nanoparticle surface chemistry,⁵⁻¹⁰ the
23 term ‘peroxidase-like’ has been used to describe the ability of inorganic (e.g. iron oxide)
24 nanoparticles to catalyze the typical colorimetric reaction involving hydrogen peroxide (H_2O_2)
25 and chromogenic reagents that are oxidized by the peroxidase enzyme.^{4,11} It is well known that
26 the oxidation of substrates by the peroxidase enzyme involves the formation of free radicals,¹²⁻¹⁴
27 as evidence by EPR measurements with DMPO.¹⁵ We used the term ‘peroxidase-like’ to describe
28 the activity in Fenton-based reactions, whereby iron oxides catalyze the decomposition of
29 hydrogen peroxide (H_2O_2) into reactive oxygen species (ROS), such as the radicals $\bullet\text{OH}$ and
30 $\bullet\text{OOH}$.¹⁶
31
32
33
34
35
36
37
38
39
40
41
42
43
44
45
46
47
48

49 The authors also hold that the, from the results of our work, no catalytic activity can be attributed
50 to the nanoparticles. Their assertion is based on a somewhat simplified calculation, as for
51 example they did not consider the actual iron distribution in a Fe-containing nanoparticle, that is,
52
53
54
55
56
57
58
59
60

1
2
3 that only ions located at the particle surface can participate of the reaction, and this is a minor
4 fraction of total iron that depends on the particle size. Neither had they considered that the
5 DMPO trapping efficiency varies for every oxygen-centered radical.
6
7

8
9
10 For those reasons, in our manuscript we quantified the free radical production by comparing
11 against control samples (i.e., without nanoparticles), and we further reported the absolute
12 concentration in each case. These measurements indicate that the free radical concentration
13 increased by a factor of ~10 in presence of magnetite nanoparticles. Furthermore, we observed
14 that the reaction rate was dependent on the ferrite composition.
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22

23 We believe that it is not adequate to normalize the free radical concentration by the total amount
24 of Fe(II) of the nanoparticles in the solution because only the superficial iron ions participate in
25 the reaction. Specifically, assuming that available Fe(II) ions are those located within a surface
26 shell of ≈ 0.8 nm thickness (i.e., the lattice parameter value for spinel), the ratio $R =$
27
$$\frac{\text{Volume Shell}}{\text{Volume of Nanoparticle}}$$

28 for the particles of our work having sizes between 10-12 nm is $R \sim 0.35-$
29 0.40 , respectively. That is, only ~40% of the Fe(II) ions can participate in the reaction. Indeed,
30 we recently published a work in which we compare the TMB oxidation rate by the ferrite
31 nanoparticles with the free iron ions from metal salts at the same nanoparticle iron concentration,
32 and within our experimental sensitivity, we observed that only nanoparticles were able to oxidize
33 TMB and not free iron ions.¹⁷ This result rules out the effect of iron impurities as suggested by
34 the comment's authors. Also, the Fenton reaction *is* a catalytic reaction.
35
36
37
38
39
40
41
42
43
44
45
46
47
48
49
50

51 A final remark related to the comment about the non-observed catalytic activity at
52 physiological pH: although we reported non-catalytic activity at pH 7.4 (PBS), free radical
53 formation in presence of nanoparticles was clearly observed *in vitro*. The expected intracellular
54
55
56
57
58
59
60

1
2
3 localization of the dextran-coated nanoparticles once they are incorporated into the cell could be
4 the lysosome (pH 4.8),^{18,19} and an important free radical formation was observed at this pH, in
5 our work and others that reported a dual enzymatic-like activity of peroxidase at acidic pH and
6 catalase at neutral pH.⁶ Therefore, contrary to the final remark of the comment, these results
7 show that at physiological conditions, free radicals were clearly formed.
8
9

10 The aim of our work is centered in the quantification and the study of the catalytic activity
11 with different particle compositions. The analysis of the free radical production is relevant
12 because the magnetic nanoparticles are experimentally or clinically used in different applications
13 such as magnetic resonance imaging (MRI), ophthalmology, and hyperthermia treatment among
14 others.²⁰ However, we did not attempt to extrapolate our results to a further interpretation from
15 the point of view of any neurodegenerative pathology. The application of these results in
16 neurodegenerative pathologies in general, and in the Alzheimer disease in particular, is very
17 distant from the scope of our article.¹
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28
29
30
31
32
33
34

35 REFERENCES

- 36
37
38 ¹ Moreno Maldonado, A. C.; Winkler, E. L.; Raineri, M.; Toro Córdova, A.; Rodríguez, L. M.;
39 Troiani, H. E.; Mojica Piscioti, M. L.; Mansilla, M. V.; Tobia, D.; Nadal, M. S.; et al. Free-
40 Radical Formation by the Peroxidase-Like Catalytic Activity of MFe₂O₄ (M=Fe, Ni, and Mn)
41 Nanoparticles. *J. Phys. Chem. C* **2019**, *123* (33), 20617–20627.
42 <https://doi.org/10.1021/acs.jpcc.9b05371>.
43
44
45
46
47
48
49 ² Meunier, B.; Robert, A. Comment on "Free-Radical Formation by the Peroxidase-like Catalytic
50 Activity of MFe₂O₄ (M = Fe, Ni and Mn) Nanoparticules". *J. Phys. Chem. C* **2019**.
51
52
53 ³ Mugesh, G., et al., Diferrocenyl Diselenides: Excellent Thiol Peroxidase-Like Antioxidants.
54 *Chem. Commun.* **1998**, 2227-2228. <https://doi.org/10.1039/A805941A>.
55
56
57
58
59
60

- 1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28
29
30
31
32
33
34
35
36
37
38
39
40
41
42
43
44
45
46
47
48
49
50
51
52
53
54
55
56
57
58
59
60
- ⁴ Gao, L.; Fan, K.; Yan, X. Iron Oxide Nanozyme: A Multifunctional Enzyme Mimetic for Biomedical Applications. *Theranostics* **2017**, *7* (13), 3207–3227. <https://doi.org/10.7150/thno.19738>.
- ⁵ Wei, H.; Wang, E. Fe₃O₄ Magnetic Nanoparticles as Peroxidase Mimetics and Their Applications in H₂O₂ and Glucose Detection. *Anal. Chem.* **2008**, *80* (6), 2250–2254. <https://doi.org/10.1021/ac702203f>.
- ⁶ Chen, Z.; Yin, J.-J.; Zhou, Y.-T.; Zhang, Y.; Song, L.; Song, M.; Hu, S.; Gu, N. Dual Enzyme-like Activities of Iron Oxide Nanoparticles and Their Implication for Diminishing Cytotoxicity. *ACS Nano* **2012**, *6* (5), 4001–4012. <https://doi.org/10.1021/nn300291r>.
- ⁷ Yang, Y.-C.; Wang, Y.-T.; Tseng, W.-L. Amplified Peroxidase-Like Activity in Iron Oxide Nanoparticles Using Adenosine Monophosphate: Application to Urinary Protein Sensing. *ACS Appl. Mater. Interfaces* **2017**, *9* (11), 10069–10077. <https://doi.org/10.1021/acsami.6b15654>.
- ⁸ Zhang, X.-Q.; Gong, S.-W.; Zhang, Y.; Yang, T.; Wang, C.-Y.; Gu, N. Prussian Blue Modified Iron Oxide Magnetic Nanoparticles and Their High Peroxidase-like Activity. *J. Mater. Chem.* **2010**, *20* (24), 5110. <https://doi.org/10.1039/c0jm00174k>.
- ⁹ Yu, F.; Huang, Y.; Cole, A. J.; Yang, V. C. The Artificial Peroxidase Activity of Magnetic Iron Oxide Nanoparticles and Its Application to Glucose Detection. *Biomaterials* **2009**, *30* (27), 4716–4722. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.biomaterials.2009.05.005>.
- ¹⁰ Liu, S.; Lu, F.; Xing, R.; Zhu, J.-J. Structural Effects of Fe₃O₄ Nanocrystals on Peroxidase-Like Activity. *Chem. - A Eur. J.* **2011**, *17* (2), 620–625. <https://doi.org/10.1002/chem.201001789>.
- ¹¹ Jiang, B.; Duan, D.; Gao, L.; Zhou, M.; Fan, K.; Tang, Y.; Xi, J.; Bi, Y.; Tong, Z.; Gao, G. F.; et al. Standardized Assays for Determining the Catalytic Activity and Kinetics of Peroxidase-like Nanozymes. *Nat. Protoc.* **2018**, *13* (7), 1506–1520. <https://doi.org/10.1038/s41596-018-0001-1>.
- ¹² Sadrzadeh, S. M. H.; Graf, E.; Panter, S. S.; Hallaway, P. E.; Eaton, J. W. Hemoglobin. A Biologic Fenton Reagent. *J. Biol. Chem.* **1984**, *259* (23), 14354–14356.
- ¹³ Svistunenko, D. A. Reaction of Haem Containing Proteins and Enzymes with Hydroperoxides: The Radical View. *Biochim Biophys Acta.* **2005**, *1707* (1), 127–155. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.bbabi.2005.01.004>.
- ¹⁴ Chen, S. X.; Schopfer, P. Hydroxyl-Radical Production in Physiological Reactions. A Novel Function of Peroxidase. *Eur. J. Biochem.* **1999**, *260* (3), 726–735. <https://doi.org/10.1046/j.1432->

1
2
3 1327.1999.00199.x.
4

5 ¹⁵ Ai, J.; Zhang, W.; Liao, G.; Xia, H.; Wang, D. NH₂Fe₃O₄@SiO₂ Supported Peroxidase
6 Catalyzed H₂O₂ for Degradation of Endocrine Disrupter from Aqueous Solution: Roles of
7 Active Radicals and NOMs. *Chemosphere* **2017**, *186*, 733–742.
8
9 <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.chemosphere.2017.08.039>.

10
11
12 ¹⁶ Pereira, M. C.; Oliveira, L. C. A.; Murad, E. Iron Oxide Catalysts: Fenton and Fentonlike
13 Reactions – a Review. *Clay Miner.* **2012**, *47* (3), 285–302.
14
15 <https://doi.org/10.1180/claymin.2012.047.3.01>.

16
17 ¹⁷ Raineri, M.; Winkler, E. L.; Torres, T. E.; Vasquez Mansilla, M.; Nadal, M. S.; Zysler, R. D.;
18 Lima, E. Effects of Biological Buffer Solutions on the Peroxidase-like Catalytic Activity of
19 Fe₃ O₄ Nanoparticles. *Nanoscale* **2019**, *11*, 18393-18406.
20
21 <https://doi.org/10.1039/C9NR05799D>.

22
23
24 ¹⁸ Clerc, P.; Jeanjean, P.; Hallalli, N.; Gougeon, M.; Pipy, B.; Carrey, J.; Fourmy, D.; Gigoux, V.
25 Targeted Magnetic Intra-Lysosomal Hyperthermia Produces Lysosomal Reactive Oxygen
26 Species and Causes Caspase-1 Dependent Cell Death. *J. Control. Release* **2018**, *270*, 120–134.
27
28 <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jconrel.2017.11.050>.

29
30
31 ¹⁹ Arbab, A. S.; Wilson, L. B.; Ashari, P.; Jordan, E. K.; Lewis, B. K.; Frank, J. A. A Model of
32
33 Lysosomal Metabolism of Dextran Coated Superparamagnetic Iron Oxide (SPIO) Nanoparticles:
34
35 Implications for Cellular Magnetic Resonance Imaging. *NMR Biomed.* **2005**, *18* (6), 383–389.
36
37 <https://doi.org/10.1002/nbm.970>.

38
39
40 ²⁰ Nguyen TK Thanh (Ed.). *Clinical Applications of Magnetic Nanoparticles. From Fabrication*
41
42 *to Clinical Applications.*; CRC Press: Boca Raton, USA, 2018.
43
44
45
46
47
48
49
50
51
52
53
54
55
56
57
58
59
60